

**Hegel, Marx & Vygotsky**  
**Essays on Social Philosophy**

*By*  
Andy Blunden

2021

## Table of Contents

Acknowledgements .....	xi
Analytical Contents List .....	xiii
Introduction .....	1
* * * .....	2
1. What is the Difference Between Hegel and Marx?.....	5
The main difference between Hegel and Marx is the times they lived in .....	5
The Young Marx vs. Hegel on the state .....	6
Hegel and Marx on universal suffrage .....	8
Marx and Hegel on the state.....	9
Hegel’s misogyny .....	10
Hegel’s failure to see the contradiction in the value of commodities.....	10
Universal suffrage and participatory democracy .....	11
In what sense was Hegel an idealist? .....	11
(a). Hegel described himself as an Idealist.....	12
(b). Hegel emphasised the active side rather than passive contemplation .....	12
(c). Hegel took the social elite to be the agents of change .....	13
(d). Hegel believed that institutions tend to be true to their concept.....	14
(e). Hegel minimised the effect of mundane relations on institutions .....	14
(f). Hegel overestimated speculative reason relative to social process itself.....	15
Turning Hegel on his head .....	16
Goethe, Hegel and Marx.....	17
Activity and concepts .....	18
The Method of Political Economy .....	18
The commodity.....	19
Unit and germ cell.....	20
The Urpraxis is the ‘simplest social form’ .....	20
‘Everything’ vs. a Gestalt.....	21
Commodity and capital.....	21
Summary .....	22
2. The Unit of Analysis and Germ Cell in Hegel, Marx and Vygotsky.....	23
Part I: From Goethe to Marx .....	23
Origins of the concept of “cell” as a method of analysis .....	23
Hegel’s formulation of the idea .....	24
The One .....	26
Marx’s appropriation of Hegel .....	27
The unit of capital .....	28
The development of science .....	28
Hegel on mediation and immediacy .....	29
Part II: Vygotsky and Activity Theory.....	29
Vygotsky on the method of double stimulation .....	29
Word meaning .....	31
Concepts as units of the intellect .....	32
The formation of concepts .....	33
Germ cell and unit of analysis.....	34
Five applications of the method of analysis by units .....	35
The importance of Vygotsky for social theory.....	37
A note on reification and units of analysis.....	37

Marx's Capital.....	37
Vygotsky's Thinking and Speech .....	39
3. Concrete Historicism as a Research Paradigm.....	41
Structuralism and abstract historicism .....	41
Logic and history in Hegel.....	42
Logic and history for Marx .....	44
Logic and development for Vygotsky.....	46
Logic and history for Foucault .....	47
Concrete historicism .....	48
Units of analysis.....	49
The germ cell .....	49
Conclusion.....	51
4. <i>Perezhivanie</i> as Human Self-creation.....	53
Introduction.....	53
No mystery.....	53
An experience.....	54
Etymology.....	55
Catharsis.....	55
Personality.....	57
Continuity and discontinuity .....	58
Unity.....	58
Lived experiences.....	59
Units .....	60
Development .....	60
Reflection.....	61
Examples.....	62
Critiques.....	63
<i>Perezhivaniya</i> on the social-historical plane .....	64
Conclusion.....	65
5. Agency .....	67
The domains of self-determination .....	67
Free will.....	68
The natural will.....	69
The development of the will in childhood .....	70
Self-control .....	71
Acquisition of ideals.....	72
<i>Perezhivaniya</i> .....	72
Freedom and the state .....	73
Voluntary association .....	74
Alliance politics .....	75
Conclusion.....	75
6. Tool and Sign in Vygotsky's Development.....	77
Part 1: <i>Ape, Primitive Man and Child</i> .....	77
History and evolution .....	79
Periodisation of the intellect .....	79
Periodisation of tools .....	80
Tools and the mind: Technical tools and psychological tools.....	81
Vygotsky's periodisation of word use in "primitive man" .....	82
Lines of development differentiate and interact.....	85

Instrumental Psychology: history or method? .....	86
Part 2: Tool and sign in Vygotsky after 1930 .....	87
The instrumental method in psychology.....	87
History of Development of Higher Mental Functions .....	88
Thinking and Speech.....	90
Part 3. Marx, Engels, Vygotsky and the Marxist tradition.....	91
Marx and Engels on ‘Just So stories’ .....	91
Labour and language.....	92
A.N. Leontyev on labour and tools.....	93
Tools and operations in activity theory.....	94
Postscript: Engels and Vygotsky .....	95
Conclusion.....	96
7. Vygotsky’s Theory of Child Development.....	97
The concepts of Vygotsky’s periodisation.....	97
Social situation of development .....	97
Central neoformation .....	100
Lines of development.....	101
Age levels .....	101
Self-relation and the crisis periods.....	102
‘Leading activity’ and Zone of Proximal Development .....	103
8. The Concept of Object.....	107
The various concepts of object.....	107
Hegel’s <i>Objekt</i> and <i>Gegenstand</i> .....	107
Objective and universal.....	108
Marx’s critique of Hegel and Feuerbach .....	109
<i>Arbeitsgegenstand</i> – the object to be worked upon.....	110
The imagined and desired state of the world .....	111
The problem of ‘objective motives’ .....	111
The object is consumed and reproduced.....	112
Object-concept.....	113
Boundary objects.....	114
The object of a project .....	115
Conclusion.....	116
9. Leontyev’s Activity Theory and Personality .....	117
Part 1. Objects and activities in Leontyev’s activity theory.....	117
Problems in Leontyev’s conception of ‘activity’ .....	118
Motivation .....	119
Objectivism .....	121
The object .....	121
Personal sense .....	122
Ideology .....	123
Particularity .....	125
(a) Dogmatism .....	128
(b) Functionalism.....	128
(c) ‘Productivism’ .....	129
Part 2. Leontyev’s theory of the personality .....	129
Part 3. A ‘project’ as an activity .....	131
10. Fedor Vasilyuk’s Psychology of Life-projects .....	133
<i>Otnoshiniye</i> (отношение) .....	133

The Lifeworld (жизненный мир) .....	134
<i>Perezhivanie</i> (переживание) .....	135
Types of <i>perezhivanie</i> .....	136
Social theory .....	137
11. The Invention of Nicaraguan Sign Language.....	139
Introduction.....	139
Vygotsky on the ideal form.....	140
Deaf children in Nicaragua.....	141
The effect of the 1979 revolution .....	142
APRIAS (Association to Help and Integrate the Deaf).....	144
Was ANSNIC acting alone? .....	146
Minimal conditions for acquisition of a sign language .....	147
Minimal conditions for the formation of a new sign language.....	147
In what sense may the case of NSL be generalised?.....	148
Village Sign Languages.....	148
Deaf Community Sign Languages.....	148
The development of language communities .....	149
Goldin-Meadow on the structure of personal sign.....	150
Conclusion.....	153
12. Language in Human Evolution.....	155
The co-evolution of animal behaviour and biology.....	155
Bipedalism.....	156
Carrying things.....	158
Delayed gratification.....	158
Abstraction.....	159
Gesturing.....	160
Voluntary control and conscious awareness .....	160
Gesturing again.....	162
Speech.....	162
Music and dance.....	163
How did our primate ancestors think?.....	163
Tool making .....	164
Collaborative projects.....	164
Writing.....	165
Art .....	166
Conclusions.....	166
13. Power, Activity and Human Flourishing .....	169
Collaborative project as a unit of social life .....	169
The abuse of power.....	171
Institutions .....	174
Firms .....	175
The human subject .....	176
Political economy.....	177
14. Vaccine Hesitancy .....	179
Risk culture and healthism.....	179
Trust .....	180
The 'VH compass' .....	180
The 1976 Swine Flu scare at Fort Dix.....	181
Whooping Cough vaccine scare in UK, 1977 .....	181

MMR vaccine scare in UK, 1998 .....	182
Polio vaccine boycott in Nigeria, 2003.....	182
H1N1 vaccine dispute in Europe, 2009.....	182
Persuasion and decision-making .....	183
Collaborative projects.....	185
The origins of vaccine scepticism .....	186
Conclusion.....	190
Postscript 2020 .....	190
15. Something Worth Dying For? .....	191
Foreign fighters.....	191
Islamism and the duty of the individual Muslim .....	191
Who is fighting? .....	193
Who wants to be a foreign fighter? .....	194
Collaborative projects.....	196
Conclusion.....	198
16. <i>Capital</i> and the <i>Urpraxis</i> of Socialism.....	199
Preliminaries.....	199
I. Goethe, Hegel, Marx, Vygotsky.....	199
Part II.....	201
17. Virtue and Utopia .....	205
Internal goods.....	206
Problems with MacIntyre's virtue ethics .....	207
Consequentialism and deontology.....	208
Virtue ethics .....	208
Practical anarchism and virtue ethics.....	209
Goals and motives.....	211
Ethics and Utopia.....	211
The virtues of practices .....	213
Anarchism and mediation.....	213
Anarchist anthropology .....	214
Summary .....	214
The question of delegation and hierarchy.....	215
Conclusion.....	215
18. The Origins of Collective Decision Making (Synopsis).....	217
The question .....	217
Research methodology .....	217
Collective decisions without voting .....	218
Counsel.....	218
Where did Majority come from? .....	219
Origins of Majority.....	220
The development of majoritarianism .....	221
Crisis of majoritarianism.....	222
The Quakers and Consensus.....	222
Myles Horton and Consensus in SNCC.....	223
James Lawson and Consensus in SNCC.....	224
Women Strike for Peace.....	225
1968 and after.....	225
Conclusion.....	226
Postscript .....	226

19. False Heroes and Villains .....	229
Villains and false heroes .....	229
John Howard .....	230
The right-wing populist narrative .....	231
An alternative left-wing narrative .....	231
20. Amartya Sen on Critical Voice and Social Choice Theory .....	233
The critique of distributive justice .....	233
Amartya Sen .....	233
Human needs and social justice .....	234
Wealth .....	234
Functioning .....	234
Capability .....	235
Voice .....	235
Critical voice .....	236
Utilitarianism and Positivism .....	238
Utilitarianism and the real ethic of bourgeois society .....	239
Sen's critique of social choice theory .....	240
Conclusion .....	242
21. Comments on 'Social Capital' .....	245
22. Nancy Fraser on Welfare Dependency .....	249
Pre-capitalist society .....	249
Wage labour .....	250
Domestic labour .....	252
Public assistance .....	252
Universal and targeted benefits .....	254
Dependency as a personality trait .....	254
Building capacity vs. philanthropy .....	255
The ideology of self-help .....	256
23. Anthony Giddens on Structuration .....	259
The knowledgeability of social actors .....	260
Routines .....	261
Practical consciousness .....	262
Concepts and motives .....	264
Unintended consequences and conceptual development .....	265
Institutions and social movements .....	266
Conclusion .....	266
24. Bourdieu on Status, Class and Culture .....	269
Capital .....	269
Field and habitus .....	271
Class and habitus .....	271
Cultural capital and educational capital .....	272
Social capital, body capital, linguistic capital, political capital .....	273
Cultural relativism .....	273
Idealism .....	274
Political opinion formation .....	275
Systems of status subordination .....	276
Social capital theory .....	276
Axel Honneth's criticism of Bourdieu .....	277
Subjectivity .....	277

Conclusion.....	278
25. The Coronavirus Pandemic is a World <i>Perezhivanie</i> .....	279
26. As of 2020, the American Century is Over.....	283
References.....	289
Index.....	297